Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF)
Request for Comments: 7856
Category: Standards Track
ISSN: 2070-1721

Y. Cui
J. Dong
P. Wu
M. Xu
Tsinghua University
A. Yla-Jaaski
Aalto University

May 2016

Softwire Mesh Management Information Base (MIB)

Abstract

This memo defines a portion of the Management Information Base (MIB) for use with network management protocols in the Internet community. In particular, it defines objects for managing a softwire mesh.

Status of This Memo

This is an Internet Standards Track document.

This document is a product of the Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF). It represents the consensus of the IETF community. It has received public review and has been approved for publication by the Internet Engineering Steering Group (IESG). Further information on Internet Standards is available in Section 2 of RFC 5741.

Information about the current status of this document, any errata, and how to provide feedback on it may be obtained at http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc7856.

Table of Contents

1. Introduction

The softwire mesh framework [RFC5565] is a tunneling mechanism that enables connectivity between islands of IPv4 networks across a single IPv6 backbone and vice versa. In a softwire mesh, extended Multiprotocol BGP (MP-BGP) is used to set up tunnels and advertise prefixes among Address Family Border Routers (AFBRs).

This memo defines a portion of the Management Information Base (MIB) for use with network management protocols in the Internet community. In particular, it defines objects for managing a softwire mesh [RFC5565].

2. The Internet-Standard Management Framework

For a detailed overview of the documents that describe the current Internet-Standard Management Framework, please refer to section 7 of RFC 3410 [RFC3410].

Managed objects are accessed via a virtual information store, termed the Management Information Base or MIB. MIB objects are generally accessed through the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP). Objects in the MIB are defined using the mechanisms defined in the Structure of Management Information (SMI). This memo specifies a MIB

module that is compliant to the SMIv2, which is described in STD 58, RFC 2578 [RFC2578], STD 58, RFC 2579 [RFC2579] and STD 58, RFC 2580 [RFC2580].

3. Terminology

This document uses terminology from the softwire problem statement [RFC4925], the BGP encapsulation Subsequent Address Family Identifier (SAFI), the BGP tunnel encapsulation attribute [RFC5512], the softwire mesh framework [RFC5565], and the BGP IPsec tunnel encapsulation attribute [RFC5566].

The key words "MUST", "MUST NOT", "REQUIRED", "SHALL", "SHALL NOT", "SHOULD", "SHOULD NOT", "RECOMMENDED", "NOT RECOMMENDED", "MAY", and "OPTIONAL" in this document are to be interpreted as described in RFC 2119 [RFC2119].

4. Structure of the MIB Module

The Softwire Mesh MIB provides a method to monitor the softwire mesh objects through SNMP.

4.1. The swmSupportedTunnelTable Subtree

The swmSupportedTunnelTable subtree provides the information about what types of tunnels can be used for softwire mesh scenarios in the AFBR. The softwire mesh framework [RFC5565] does not mandate the use of any particular tunneling technology. Based on the BGP tunnel encapsulation attribute tunnel types introduced by RFC 5512 [RFC5512] and RFC 5566 [RFC5566], the softwire mesh tunnel types include at least L2TPv3 (Layer 2 Tunneling Protocol version 3) over IP, GRE (Generic Routing Encapsulation), Transmit tunnel endpoint, IPsec in Tunnel-mode, IP in IP tunnel with IPsec Transport Mode, MPLS-in-IP tunnel with IPsec Transport Mode, and IP in IP. The detailed encapsulation information of different tunnel types (e.g., L2TPv3 Session ID, GRE Key, etc.) is not managed in the Softwire Mesh MIB.

4.2. The swmEncapsTable Subtree

The swmEncapsTable subtree provides softwire mesh NLRI-NH information (Network Layer Reachability Information - Next Hop) about the AFBR. It keeps the mapping between the External-IP (E-IP) prefix and the Internal-IP (I-IP) address of the next hop. The mappings determine which I-IP destination address will be used to encapsulate the received packet according to its E-IP destination address. The definitions of E-IP and I-IP are explained in Section 4.1 of RFC 5565 [RFC5565]. The number of entries in swmEncapsTable shows how many softwire mesh tunnels are maintained in this AFBR.

4.3. The swmBGPNeighborTable Subtree

This subtree provides the softwire mesh BGP neighbor information of an AFBR. It includes the address of the softwire mesh BGP peer and the kind of tunnel that the AFBR would use to communicate with this BGP peer.

4.4. The swmConformance Subtree

This subtree provides the conformance information of MIB objects.

5. Relationship to Other MIB Modules

5.1. Relationship to the IF-MIB

The Interfaces MIB [RFC2863] defines generic managed objects for managing interfaces. Each logical interface (physical or virtual) has an ifEntry. Tunnels are handled by creating logical interfaces (ifEntry). Being a tunnel, the softwire mesh interface has an entry in the Interface MIB, as well as an entry in the IP Tunnel MIB. Those corresponding entries are indexed by ifIndex.

The ifOperStatus in the ifTable represents whether the mesh function of the AFBR has been triggered. If the softwire mesh capability is negotiated during the BGP OPEN phase, the mesh function is considered to be started, and the ifOperStatus is "up". Otherwise, the ifOperStatus is "down".

In the case of an IPv4-over-IPv6 softwire mesh tunnel, ifInUcastPkts counts the number of IPv6 packets that are sent to the virtual interface for decapsulation into IPv4. The ifOutUcastPkts counts the number of IPv6 packets that are generated by encapsulating IPv4 packets sent to the virtual interface. In particular, if these IPv4 packets need fragmentation, ifOutUcastPkts counts the number of packets after fragmentation.

In the case of an IPv6-over-IPv4 softwire mesh tunnel, ifInUcastPkts counts the number of IPv4 packets that are delivered to the virtual interface for decapsulation into IPv6. The ifOutUcastPkts counts the number of IPv4 packets that are generated by encapsulating IPv6 packets sent down to the virtual interface. In particular, if these IPv6 packets need to be fragmented, ifOutUcastPkts counts the number of packets after fragmentation. Similar definitions apply to other counter objects in the ifTable.

5.2. Relationship to the IP Tunnel MIB

The IP Tunnel MIB [RFC4087] contains objects applicable to all IP tunnels, including softwire mesh tunnels. Meanwhile, the Softwire Mesh MIB extends the IP Tunnel MIB to further describe encapsulation-specific information.

When running a point-to-multipoint tunnel, it is necessary for a softwire mesh AFBR to maintain an encapsulation table in order to perform correct "forwarding" among AFBRs. This forwarding function on an AFBR is performed by using the E-IP destination address to look up the I-IP encapsulation destination address in the encapsulation table. An AFBR also needs to know the BGP peer information of the other AFBRs, so that it can negotiate the NLRI-NH information and the tunnel parameters with them.

The Softwire Mesh MIB requires the implementation of the IP Tunnel MIB. The tunnelIfEncapsMethod in the tunnelIfEntry MUST be set to softwireMesh(16), and a corresponding entry in the Softwire Mesh MIB module will be presented for the tunnelIfEntry. The tunnelIfRemoteInetAddress MUST be set to "0.0.0.0" for IPv4 or "::" for IPv6 because it is a point-to-multipoint tunnel.

The tunnelIfAddressType in the tunnelIfTable represents the type of address in the corresponding tunnelIfLocalInetAddress and tunnelIfRemoteInetAddress objects. The tunnelIfAddressType is identical to swmEncapsIIPDstType in softwire mesh, which can support either IPv4-over-IPv6 or IPv6-over-IPv4. When the swmEncapsEIPDstType is IPv6 and the swmEncapsIIPDstType is IPv4, the tunnel type is IPv6-over-IPv4; when the swmEncapsEIPDstType is IPv4 and the swmEncapsIIPDstType is IPv6, the encapsulation mode is IPv4-over-IPv6.

5.3. MIB Modules Required for IMPORTS

The following MIB module IMPORTS objects from SNMPv2-SMI [RFC2578], SNMPv2-CONF [RFC2580], IF-MIB [RFC2863], and INET-ADDRESS-MIB [RFC4001].

6. Definitions

```
   SOFTWIRE-MESH-MIB DEFINITIONS ::= BEGIN

   IMPORTS
       MODULE-IDENTITY, OBJECT-TYPE, mib-2 FROM SNMPv2-SMI

       OBJECT-GROUP, MODULE-COMPLIANCE             FROM SNMPv2-CONF

       InetAddress, InetAddressType, InetAddressPrefixLength

       FROM INET-ADDRESS-MIB

       ifIndex                                  FROM IF-MIB

       IANAtunnelType                           FROM IANAifType-MIB;

       swmMIB MODULE-IDENTITY
       LAST-UPDATED "201605110000Z"        -- May 11, 2016
       ORGANIZATION "Softwire Working Group"
       CONTACT-INFO
                "Yong Cui
                 Email:  yong@csnet1.cs.tsinghua.edu.cn

                 Jiang Dong
                 Email:  knight.dongjiang@gmail.com

                 Peng Wu
                 Email:  weapon9@gmail.com

                 Mingwei Xu
                 Email:  xmw@cernet.edu.cn

                 Antti Yla-Jaaski
                 Email:  antti.yla-jaaski@aalto.fi

                 Email comments directly to the Softwire WG Mailing
                 List at softwires@ietf.org
                "
       DESCRIPTION
              "This MIB module contains managed object definitions for
               the softwire mesh framework.

               Copyright (c) 2016 IETF Trust and the persons
               identified as authors of the code.  All rights reserved.

               Redistribution and use in source and binary forms, with
               or without modification, is permitted pursuant to, and
```

```
               subject to the license terms contained in, the Simplified
               BSD License set forth in Section 4.c of the IETF Trust's
               Legal Provisions Relating to IETF Documents
               (http://trustee.ietf.org/license-info)."
        REVISION    "201605110000Z"
        DESCRIPTION "Initial version, published as RFC 7856"
        ::= { mib-2 239 }

    swmObjects OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { swmMIB 1 }

    -- swmSupportedTunnelTable
    swmSupportedTunnelTable OBJECT-TYPE
        SYNTAX      SEQUENCE OF SwmSupportedTunnelEntry
        MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
        STATUS      current
        DESCRIPTION
            "A table of objects that show what kinds of tunnels
            can be supported by the AFBR."
        ::= { swmObjects 1 }

    swmSupportedTunnelEntry  OBJECT-TYPE
        SYNTAX      SwmSupportedTunnelEntry
        MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
        STATUS      current
        DESCRIPTION
            "A set of objects that show what kinds of tunnels
            can be supported in the AFBR.  If the AFBR supports
            multiple tunnel types, the swmSupportedTunnelTable
            would have several entries."
        INDEX { swmSupportedTunnelType }
        ::= { swmSupportedTunnelTable 1 }

    SwmSupportedTunnelEntry ::= SEQUENCE {
        swmSupportedTunnelType              IANAtunnelType
    }

    swmSupportedTunnelType OBJECT-TYPE
        SYNTAX      IANAtunnelType
        MAX-ACCESS  read-only
        STATUS      current
        DESCRIPTION
            "Represents the tunnel type that can be used for softwire
            mesh scenarios, such as L2TPv3 over IP, GRE, Transmit
            tunnel endpoint, IPsec in Tunnel-mode, IP in IP tunnel with
            IPsec Transport Mode, MPLS-in-IP tunnel with IPsec Transport
            Mode, and IP in IP.  There is no restriction on the tunnel
            type the softwire mesh can use."
         REFERENCE
```

```
            "L2TPv3 over IP, GRE, and IP in IP in RFC 5512.
            Transmit tunnel endpoint, IPsec in Tunnel-mode, IP in IP
            tunnel with IPsec Transport Mode, MPLS-in-IP tunnel with
            IPsec Transport Mode in RFC 5566."
        ::= { swmSupportedTunnelEntry 1 }

    -- end of swmSupportedTunnelTable

    --swmEncapsTable
    swmEncapsTable OBJECT-TYPE
        SYNTAX      SEQUENCE OF SwmEncapsEntry
        MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
        STATUS      current
        DESCRIPTION
            "A table of objects that display the
            softwire mesh encapsulation information."
        ::= { swmObjects 2 }

    swmEncapsEntry  OBJECT-TYPE
        SYNTAX      SwmEncapsEntry
        MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
        STATUS      current
        DESCRIPTION
            "A table of objects that manage the softwire mesh I-IP
             encapsulation destination based on the E-IP destination
             prefix."
        INDEX { ifIndex,
                swmEncapsEIPDstType,
                swmEncapsEIPDst,
                swmEncapsEIPPrefixLength
              }
        ::= { swmEncapsTable 1 }

    SwmEncapsEntry ::=      SEQUENCE {
        swmEncapsEIPDstType       InetAddressType,
        swmEncapsEIPDst           InetAddress,
        swmEncapsEIPPrefixLength  InetAddressPrefixLength,
        swmEncapsIIPDstType       InetAddressType,
        swmEncapsIIPDst           InetAddress
    }

    swmEncapsEIPDstType OBJECT-TYPE
        SYNTAX      InetAddressType
        MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
        STATUS      current
        DESCRIPTION
            "This object specifies the address type used for
            swmEncapsEIPDst.  It is different from the
```

```
            tunnelIfAddressType in the tunnelIfTable.  The
            swmEncapsEIPDstType is IPv6 (2) if it is IPv6-over-IPv4
            tunneling.  The swmEncapsEIPDstType is
            IPv4 (1) if it is IPv4-over-IPv6 tunneling."
        REFERENCE
            "IPv4 and IPv6 in RFC 4001."
        ::= { swmEncapsEntry 1 }

    swmEncapsEIPDst OBJECT-TYPE
        SYNTAX      InetAddress
        MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
        STATUS      current
        DESCRIPTION
            "The E-IP destination prefix, which is
            used for I-IP encapsulation destination looking up.
            The type of this address is determined by the
            value of swmEncapsEIPDstType"
        REFERENCE
            "E-IP and I-IP in RFC 5565."
        ::= { swmEncapsEntry 2 }

    swmEncapsEIPPrefixLength OBJECT-TYPE
        SYNTAX      InetAddressPrefixLength
        MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
        STATUS      current
        DESCRIPTION
            "The prefix length of the E-IP destination prefix."
        ::= { swmEncapsEntry 3 }

    swmEncapsIIPDstType OBJECT-TYPE
        SYNTAX      InetAddressType
        MAX-ACCESS  read-only
        STATUS      current
        DESCRIPTION
            "This object specifies the address type used for
             swmEncapsIIPDst.  It is the same as the tunnelIfAddressType
             in the tunnelIfTable."
        REFERENCE
            "IPv4 and IPv6 in RFC 4001."
        ::= { swmEncapsEntry 4 }

    swmEncapsIIPDst OBJECT-TYPE
        SYNTAX      InetAddress
        MAX-ACCESS  read-only
        STATUS      current
        DESCRIPTION
            "The I-IP destination address, which is used as the
            encapsulation destination for the corresponding E-IP
```

```
            prefix.  Since the tunnelIfRemoteInetAddress in the
            tunnelIfTable should be 0.0.0.0 or ::, swmEncapIIPDst
            should be the destination address used in the outer
            IP header."
        REFERENCE
            "E-IP and I-IP in RFC 5565."
        ::= { swmEncapsEntry 5 }
    -- End of swmEncapsTable

    -- swmBGPNeighborTable
    swmBGPNeighborTable OBJECT-TYPE
        SYNTAX      SEQUENCE OF SwmBGPNeighborEntry
        MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
        STATUS      current
        DESCRIPTION
            "A table of objects that display the softwire mesh
            BGP neighbor information."
        ::= { swmObjects 3 }

    swmBGPNeighborEntry  OBJECT-TYPE
        SYNTAX      SwmBGPNeighborEntry
        MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
        STATUS      current
        DESCRIPTION
            "A set of objects that display the softwire mesh
            BGP neighbor information."
        INDEX {
                ifIndex,
                swmBGPNeighborInetAddressType,
                swmBGPNeighborInetAddress
              }
        ::= { swmBGPNeighborTable 1 }

    SwmBGPNeighborEntry ::= SEQUENCE {
            swmBGPNeighborInetAddressType    InetAddressType,
            swmBGPNeighborInetAddress        InetAddress,
            swmBGPNeighborTunnelType         IANAtunnelType
    }

    swmBGPNeighborInetAddressType OBJECT-TYPE
        SYNTAX      InetAddressType
        MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
        STATUS      current
        DESCRIPTION
            "This object specifies the address type used for
             swmBGPNeighborInetAddress."
        ::= { swmBGPNeighborEntry 1 }
```

```
   swmBGPNeighborInetAddress OBJECT-TYPE
       SYNTAX      InetAddress
       MAX-ACCESS  not-accessible
       STATUS      current
       DESCRIPTION
           "The address of the AFBR's BGP neighbor.  The
           address type is the same as the tunnelIfAddressType
           in the tunnelIfTable."
       ::= { swmBGPNeighborEntry 2 }

   swmBGPNeighborTunnelType OBJECT-TYPE
       SYNTAX      IANAtunnelType
       MAX-ACCESS  read-only
       STATUS      current
       DESCRIPTION
           "Represents the type of tunnel that the AFBR
           chooses to transmit traffic with another AFBR/BGP
           neighbor."
       ::= { swmBGPNeighborEntry 3 }
   -- End of swmBGPNeighborTable


   -- conformance information
   swmConformance
                       OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { swmMIB 2 }
   swmCompliances
                       OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { swmConformance 1 }
   swmGroups
                       OBJECT IDENTIFIER ::= { swmConformance 2 }

    -- compliance statements
   swmCompliance MODULE-COMPLIANCE
      STATUS current
      DESCRIPTION
          "Describes the requirements for conformance to the Softwire
          Mesh MIB.

          The following index objects cannot be added as OBJECT
          clauses but nevertheless have compliance requirements:
          "
          -- OBJECT  swmEncapsEIPDstType
          -- SYNTAX  InetAddressType { ipv4(1), ipv6(2) }
          -- DESCRIPTION
          -- "An implementation is required to support
          --  global IPv4 and/or IPv6 addresses, depending
          --  on its support for IPv4 and IPv6."

          -- OBJECT  swmEncapsEIPDst
```

```
          -- SYNTAX  InetAddress (SIZE(4|16))
          -- DESCRIPTION
          -- "An implementation is required to support
          --  global IPv4 and/or IPv6 addresses, depending
          --  on its support for IPv4 and IPv6."

          -- OBJECT  swmEncapsEIPPrefixLength
          -- SYNTAX  InetAddressPrefixLength (Unsigned32 (0..128))
          -- DESCRIPTION
          -- "An implementation is required to support
          --  global IPv4 and/or IPv6 addresses, depending
          --  on its support for IPv4 and IPv6."

          -- OBJECT  swmBGPNeighborInetAddressType
          -- SYNTAX  InetAddressType { ipv4(1), ipv6(2) }
          -- DESCRIPTION
          -- "An implementation is required to support
          --  global IPv4 and/or IPv6 addresses, depending
          --  on its support for IPv4 and IPv6."

          -- OBJECT  swmBGPNeighborInetAddress
          -- SYNTAX  InetAddress (SIZE(4|16))
          -- DESCRIPTION
          -- "An implementation is required to support
          --  global IPv4 and/or IPv6 addresses, depending
          --  on its support for IPv4 and IPv6."

       MODULE -- this module
       MANDATORY-GROUPS    {
                             swmSupportedTunnelGroup,
                             swmEncapsGroup,
                             swmBGPNeighborGroup
                           }
       ::= { swmCompliances 1 }

   swmSupportedTunnelGroup    OBJECT-GROUP
       OBJECTS {
           swmSupportedTunnelType
       }
       STATUS  current
       DESCRIPTION
           "The collection of objects that are used to show
           what kind of tunnel the AFBR supports."
       ::= { swmGroups 1 }

   swmEncapsGroup    OBJECT-GROUP
       OBJECTS {
            swmEncapsIIPDst,
```

```
            swmEncapsIIPDstType
        }
        STATUS  current
        DESCRIPTION
            "The collection of objects that are used to display
            softwire mesh encapsulation information."
        ::= { swmGroups 2 }

    swmBGPNeighborGroup    OBJECT-GROUP
        OBJECTS {
            swmBGPNeighborTunnelType
        }
        STATUS  current
        DESCRIPTION
            "The collection of objects that are used to display
             softwire mesh BGP neighbor information."
        ::= { swmGroups 3 }

    END
```

7. Security Considerations

Because this MIB module reuses the IP Tunnel MIB, the security considerations of the IP Tunnel MIB are also applicable to the Softwire Mesh MIB.

There are no management objects defined in this MIB module that have a MAX-ACCESS clause of read-write and/or read-create. So, if this MIB module is implemented correctly, then there is no risk that an intruder can alter or create any management objects of this MIB module via direct SNMP SET operations.

Some of the readable objects in this MIB module (i.e., objects with a MAX-ACCESS other than not-accessible) may be considered sensitive or vulnerable in some network environments. It is thus important to control even GET and/or NOTIFY access to these objects and possibly to even encrypt the values of these objects when sending them over the network via SNMP. These are the objects and their sensitivity/ vulnerability:

swmSupportedTunnelType, swmEncapsIIPDstType, swmEncapsIIPDst, and swmBGPNeighborTunnelType can expose the types of tunnels used within the internal network and potentially reveal the topology of the internal network.

SNMP versions prior to SNMPv3 did not include adequate security. Even if the network itself is secure (for example by using IPsec), there is no control as to who on the secure network is allowed to access and GET/SET (read/change/create/delete) the objects in this MIB module.

Implementations SHOULD provide the security features described by the SNMPv3 framework (see [RFC3410]), and implementations claiming compliance to the SNMPv3 standard MUST include full support for authentication and privacy via the User-based Security Model (USM) [RFC3414] with the AES cipher algorithm [RFC3826]. Implementations MAY also provide support for the Transport Security Model (TSM) [RFC5591] in combination with a secure transport such as SSH [RFC5592] or TLS/DTLS [RFC6353].

Further, deployment of SNMP versions prior to SNMPv3 is NOT RECOMMENDED. Instead, it is RECOMMENDED to deploy SNMPv3 and to enable cryptographic security. It is then a customer/operator responsibility to ensure that the SNMP entity giving access to an instance of this MIB module is properly configured to give access to the objects only to those principals (users) that have legitimate rights to indeed GET or SET (change/create/delete) them.

8. IANA Considerations

IANA has allocated the following OBJECT IDENTIFIER value and recorded it in the SMI Numbers registry in the subregistry called "SMI Network Management MGMT Codes Internet-standard MIB" under the mib-2 branch (1.3.6.1.2.1):

Descriptor	OBJECT IDENTIFIER value
swmMIB	{ mib-2 239 }

IANA has recorded the following IANAtunnelType Textual Convention within the IANAifType-MIB:

```
IANAtunnelType ::= TEXTUAL-CONVENTION
      SYNTAX     INTEGER {
                 softwireMesh(16)  -- softwire mesh tunnel
                 }
```

9. References

9.1. Normative References

[RFC2119] Bradner, S., "Key words for use in RFCs to Indicate Requirement Levels", BCP 14, RFC 2119, DOI 10.17487/RFC2119, March 1997, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2119>.

[RFC2578] McCloghrie, K., Ed., Perkins, D., Ed., and J. Schoenwaelder, Ed., "Structure of Management Information Version 2 (SMIv2)", STD 58, RFC 2578, DOI 10.17487/RFC2578, April 1999, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2578>.

[RFC2579] McCloghrie, K., Ed., Perkins, D., Ed., and J. Schoenwaelder, Ed., "Textual Conventions for SMIv2", STD 58, RFC 2579, DOI 10.17487/RFC2579, April 1999, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2579>.

[RFC2580] McCloghrie, K., Ed., Perkins, D., Ed., and J. Schoenwaelder, Ed., "Conformance Statements for SMIv2", STD 58, RFC 2580, DOI 10.17487/RFC2580, April 1999, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2580>.

[RFC3414] Blumenthal, U. and B. Wijnen, "User-based Security Model (USM) for version 3 of the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMPv3)", STD 62, RFC 3414, DOI 10.17487/RFC3414, December 2002, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3414>.

[RFC3826] Blumenthal, U., Maino, F., and K. McCloghrie, "The Advanced Encryption Standard (AES) Cipher Algorithm in the SNMP User-based Security Model", RFC 3826, DOI 10.17487/RFC3826, June 2004, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3826>.

[RFC4001] Daniele, M., Haberman, B., Routhier, S., and J. Schoenwaelder, "Textual Conventions for Internet Network Addresses", RFC 4001, DOI 10.17487/RFC4001, February 2005, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc4001>.

[RFC5512] Mohapatra, P. and E. Rosen, "The BGP Encapsulation Subsequent Address Family Identifier (SAFI) and the BGP Tunnel Encapsulation Attribute", RFC 5512, DOI 10.17487/RFC5512, April 2009, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5512>.

[RFC5565] Wu, J., Cui, Y., Metz, C., and E. Rosen, "Softwire Mesh Framework", RFC 5565, DOI 10.17487/RFC5565, June 2009, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5565>.

[RFC5566] Berger, L., White, R., and E. Rosen, "BGP IPsec Tunnel Encapsulation Attribute", RFC 5566, DOI 10.17487/RFC5566, June 2009, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5566>.

[RFC5591] Harrington, D. and W. Hardaker, "Transport Security Model for the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP)", STD 78, RFC 5591, DOI 10.17487/RFC5591, June 2009, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5591>.

[RFC5592] Harrington, D., Salowey, J., and W. Hardaker, "Secure Shell Transport Model for the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP)", RFC 5592, DOI 10.17487/RFC5592, June 2009, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc5592>.

[RFC6353] Hardaker, W., "Transport Layer Security (TLS) Transport Model for the Simple Network Management Protocol (SNMP)", STD 78, RFC 6353, DOI 10.17487/RFC6353, July 2011, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc6353>.

9.2. Informative References

[RFC2863] McCloghrie, K. and F. Kastenholz, "The Interfaces Group MIB", RFC 2863, DOI 10.17487/RFC2863, June 2000, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc2863>.

[RFC3410] Case, J., Mundy, R., Partain, D., and B. Stewart, "Introduction and Applicability Statements for Internet-Standard Management Framework", RFC 3410, DOI 10.17487/RFC3410, December 2002, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc3410>.

[RFC4087] Thaler, D., "IP Tunnel MIB", RFC 4087, DOI 10.17487/RFC4087, June 2005, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc4087>.

[RFC4925] Li, X., Ed., Dawkins, S., Ed., Ward, D., Ed., and A. Durand, Ed., "Softwire Problem Statement", RFC 4925, DOI 10.17487/RFC4925, July 2007, <http://www.rfc-editor.org/info/rfc4925>.

Acknowledgements

The authors would like to thank Dave Thaler, Jean-Philippe Dionne, Qi Sun, Sheng Jiang, and Yu Fu for their valuable comments.

Authors' Addresses

Yong Cui
Tsinghua University
Department of Computer Science, Tsinghua University
Beijing 100084
China

Phone: +86-10-6260-3059
Email: yong@csnet1.cs.tsinghua.edu.cn

Jiang Dong
Tsinghua University
Department of Computer Science, Tsinghua University
Beijing 100084
China

Phone: +86-10-6278-5822
Email: knight.dongjiang@gmail.com

Peng Wu
Tsinghua University
Department of Computer Science, Tsinghua University
Beijing 100084
China

Phone: +86-10-6278-5822
Email: weapon9@gmail.com

Mingwei Xu
Tsinghua University
Department of Computer Science, Tsinghua University
Beijing 100084
China

Phone: +86-10-6278-5822
Email: xmw@cernet.edu.cn

Antti Yla-Jaaski
Aalto University
Konemiehentie 2
Espoo 02150
Finland

Phone: +358-40-5954222
Email: antti.yla-jaaski@aalto.fi